## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

IN RE NEW ENGLAND COMPOUNDING PHARMACY, INC. PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL No. 2419 Dkt. No. 1:13-md-2419 (RWZ)

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

All Actions

# PLAINTIFFS' STEERING COMMITTEE'S ("PSC") AMENDED<sup>1</sup> FILING RELATED TO PSC, ST. THOMAS ENTITIES, PREMIER DEFENDANTS AND BOX HILL DEFENDANTS' PROPOSED PRETRIAL SCHEDULES

At the May 28, 2015 status conference, the Court requested that the Plaintiff Steering Committee ("PSC") create charts reflecting the current proposed pre-trial schedules. For the convenience of all parties and the Court, the charts below set forth the proposed pre-trial schedules for the Premier Defendants, <sup>2</sup> St. Thomas Entities, <sup>3</sup> Tennessee Clinic Defendants <sup>4</sup> and Box Hill Defendants, <sup>5</sup> respectively.

This amounded Cline

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This amended filing clarifies that the PSC's position as to the close of common discovery as it relates to settling defendants and third parties has not changed; the PSC's proposed deadline remains August 1, 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Premier Defendants" includes Premier Orthopedic Associates Surgical Ctr., Premier Orthopedics Associates Surgical Center, LLC, Premier Orthopaedic and Sports Medicine Associates of South Jersey, LLC, d/b/a Premier Orthopaedic and Sports Medicine Associates, Kimberly Yvette Smith, M.D., a/k/a Kimberly Yvette Smith-Martin, M.D., Thomas Dwyer, M.D., Richard C. DiVerniero, M.D., John Catalano, M.D., and Jeffrey Strauss, M.D.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "Saint Thomas Entities" include Saint Thomas West Hospital, formerly known as St. Thomas Hospital, Saint Thomas Network, and Saint Thomas Health.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Tennessee Clinic Defendants" include Saint Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical Center, LLC, Howell Allen Clinic, PC, John Culclasure, MD, Debra Schamberg, RN, and Vaughan Allen, MD. The PSC specifically excludes Specialty Surgery Center, PLLC, Kenneth R. Lister, MD, Lister, MD, PC, and Donald Jones, MD from its Proposed Trial Schedule, as the plaintiffs' complaints against the Specialty Surgery Center, PLLC entity are in the process of being amended to add additional related defendants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Box Hill Defendants" includes Box Hill Surgery Systems, LLC, Ritu T. Bhambhani, M.D., and Ritu T. Bhambhani, M.D., LLC.

#### St. Thomas Entities and Tennessee Clinic Defendants:

| Event   | MDL<br>Order No.<br>9 Schedule <sup>6</sup> | PSC's<br>Proposed<br>Trial<br>Schedule <sup>7</sup> | Saint Thomas<br>Entities'<br>Proposed Trial<br>Schedule <sup>8</sup>   | Tennessee<br>Clinic<br>Defendants'<br>Proposed Trial<br>Schedule <sup>9</sup> |
|---|---|---|--|---|
| Close of Common Fact Discovery as to settling defendants and common third parties   | 6/15/15                                     | 8/1/15  | 9/14/15*   | 8/18/15   |
| Close of Common Fact<br>Discovery as to the<br>Tennessee Clinic Cases   | 6/15/15                                     | 8/1/15  | N/A  | 8/18/15   |
| Close of Common Fact<br>Discovery as to the St.<br>Thomas Cases   | 6/15/15                                     | 8/1/15  | 9/14/15*   | N/A   |
| Initial Trial Pool Cases selection exchanged in writing between the parties   | N/A   | ≤ 10 days after<br>entry of Order                   | 30 days after<br>bellwether order<br>entered:<br>Exchanging lists<br>and identifying<br>litigation<br>variables in<br>briefing | 15 days after<br>bellwether order<br>entered                                  |
| Deadline for Parties to file<br>Notice of Position on<br>Venue and Lexecon Inc. v.<br>Milberg Weiss Bershad<br>Hynes & Lerach | N/A   | ≤ 15 days after<br>entry of Order                   | 15 days after<br>bellwether order<br>entered   | 15 days after<br>bellwether order<br>entered                                  |
| Completion of all Case-<br>Specific fact discovery for<br>Initial Trial Pool cases  | N/A   | 9/15/15   | Limited Case-<br>Specific<br>discovery<br>completed within<br>120 days of<br>bellwether order                                  | 5/16/16<br>[for four trial<br>selections] <sup>10</sup>                       |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Dkt. No. 1852

<sup>7</sup> See Dkt. No. 1900

<sup>8</sup> See Dkt. Nos. 1753, 1753-1, 1870 & 1870-1.

<sup>9</sup> See Dkt. No. 1958-1

<sup>10</sup> The Tennessee Clinic Defendants' bellwether protocol proposal is at Dkt. No. 1958-2 and sets out a process of selecting sixteen cases for the trial pool, exchanging strikes, and then tracking four toward trial.

| Parties shall file           | N/A     | 10/1/15  | N/A                | N/A        |
|------------------------------|---------|----------|--------------------|------------|
| submissions as to the order  |         |          |                    |            |
| in which the eight Initial   |         |          |                    |            |
| Trial Pool Cases should be   |         |          |                    |            |
| tried and/or remanded to     |         |          |                    |            |
| the transferor courts. The   |         |          |                    |            |
| Parties are directed to file |         |          |                    |            |
| briefs, not to exceed 5      |         |          |                    |            |
| pages, with reason for       |         |          |                    |            |
| selections and order.        |         |          |                    |            |
| Court will select the order  | N/A     | 10/15/15 | N/A                | N/A        |
| in which the Initial Trial   | 1 1/11  | 10/15/15 | 1 1/11             | 11/11      |
| Pool Cases will be tried     |         |          |                    |            |
| and/or remanded,             |         |          |                    |            |
| designate the first 2 cases  |         |          |                    |            |
| to be tried and/or           |         |          |                    |            |
|                              |         |          |                    |            |
| remanded,                    | NT / A  | NT/A     | 15 1               | NT/A       |
| PSC and Healthcare           | N/A     | N/A      | 15 days after the  | N/A        |
| Defendants entitled to       |         |          | completion of      |            |
| strike up to two cases each  |         |          | Limited Case       |            |
| from Initial Bellwether      |         |          | Specific           |            |
| Pool                         | 27/1    | 77/1     | discovery          | 27/1       |
| PSC and Healthcare           | N/A     | N/A      | 30 days after      | N/A        |
| Defendants meet and          |         |          | completion of      |            |
| confer as to possible        |         |          | Limited Case       |            |
| agreed list of four          |         |          | Specific           |            |
| bellwether cases for initial |         |          | discovery          |            |
| trials                       |         |          |                    |            |
| PSC and Healthcare           | N/A     | N/A      | 45 days after      | N/A        |
| Defendants submit agreed     |         |          | completion of      |            |
| upon list of four            |         |          | Limited Case       |            |
| bellwether cases for initial |         |          | Specific           |            |
| trials or submit proposals   |         |          | discovery          |            |
| for four cases with          |         |          |                    |            |
| briefing on reasons for      |         |          |                    |            |
| selection                    |         |          |                    |            |
| Parties shall disclose       | 7/15/15 | 10/25/15 | Court to set       | 6/15/16 -  |
| experts who will testify as  |         |          | scheduling order   | Plaintiff  |
| to Case-Specific Issues for  |         |          | after selection of |            |
| the First Two Trial Case     |         |          | Bellwether Cases   | 7/15/16 -  |
| Picks along with at least    |         |          | for Initial Trials | Defendants |
| three proposed deposition    |         |          |                    |            |
| dates for each expert.       |         |          |                    |            |
| Parties shall disclose       | 8/14/15 | 11/10/15 | Court to set       | N/A        |
| rebuttal Case-Specific       |         |          | scheduling order   |            |
| Experts for the First Two    |         |          | after selection of |            |
| Emperio for the first f wo   |         |          | arter beleetion of |            |

| Trial Case Picks.  |          |                            | Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials   |  |
|--|----------|----------------------------|--|--|
| Plaintiffs shall file motion<br>for leave to file Rebuttal<br>Expert Disclosures   | 9/14/15  | N/A                        | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | N/A  |
| Parties shall complete<br>depositions of Case-<br>Specific Issues experts<br>(which will begin after<br>rebuttal reports, if any, are<br>served) | 10/13/15 | 12/15/15                   | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | 9/1/16                                       |
| Case-Specific dispositive motions and Daubert motions filed  | 12/12/15 | 12/21/15                   | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | N/A  |
| Oppositions to Case-<br>Specific dispositive<br>motions and Daubert<br>motions filed   | 1/11/16  | 1/5/16                     | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | N/A  |
| Replies to Case-Specific dispositive motions and Daubert motions filed   | 2/10/16  | 1/15/16                    | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | N/A  |
| Hearings on case-specific dispositive motions and Daubert motions  | N/A      | As determined by the Court | Court to set<br>scheduling order<br>after selection of<br>Bellwether Cases<br>for Initial Trials | N/A  |
| Cases shall be trial-ready   | N/A      | 2/1/16                     | October 2016*  | 12/1/16<br>[first case to be<br>trial ready] |

## **Premier**:

| Event   | MDL Order No.<br>9 Schedule <sup>11</sup> | PSC's Proposed<br>Trial Schedule <sup>12</sup> | Premier's Proposed Trial<br>Schedule <sup>13</sup> |
|---|---|--|--|
| Close of Common Fact Discovery as to settling defendants and common third parties                 | 6/15/15                                   | 8/31/15  | 12/15/15   |
| Close of Common as to<br>the Premier cases; Meet<br>and confer on potential<br>bellwether process | 06/15/15                                  | 11/15/15                                       | 12/15/15   |
| Close of Case Specific<br>Bellwether Discovery  | N/A                                       | 01/15/16                                       | 02/15/16   |
| Initial Expert Disclosures<br>and Proffer of Deposition<br>Dates                                  | 07/15/15                                  | 01/31/16                                       | 03/15/16   |
| Rebuttal Expert Disclosures and Proffer of Deposition Dates                                       | 08/14/15                                  | 04/04/16                                       | 05/01/16   |
| Plaintiffs shall file motion<br>for leave to file Rebuttal<br>Expert Disclosures                  | 9/14/15                                   | N/A  | N/A  |
| Deadline For Expert<br>Depositions  | 10/13/15                                  | 04/23/16                                       | 09/01/16   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See Dkt. No. 1852 <sup>12</sup> See Dkt. No. 1900 <sup>13</sup> See Dkt. No. 1950

| Dispositive Motions and Daubert Motions                             | 12/12/2015 | 05/21/16 | 10/15/16      |
|---|------------|----------|---------------|
| Oppositions to Dispositive<br>Motions and <i>Daubert</i><br>Motions | 1/11/2016  | 06/05/16 | 11/01/16      |
| Replies in Support of Dispositive Motions and Daubert Motions       | 2/10/2016  | 06/19/16 | 11/15/16      |
| Hearing on Dispositive<br>Motions and <i>Daubert</i><br>Motions     | N/A        | 07/02/16 | December 2016 |
| Final Pre-Trial Hearing   | N/A        | 07/25/16 | January 2017  |
| Trial   | N/A        | 08/01/16 | February 2017 |

## **Box Hill:**

| Event   | MDL Order No.<br>9 Schedule <sup>14</sup> | PSC's Proposed<br>Trial Schedule <sup>15</sup> | Box Hill's Proposed Trial<br>Schedule <sup>16</sup> |
|---|---|--|---|
| Close of Common Fact Discovery as to settling defendants and common third parties | 6/15/15                                   | 8/1/15   | 4/1/16  |
| Close of Common Issue<br>Discovery as to Box Hill<br>cases                        | 6/15/15                                   | 1/22/16  | 4/1/16  |
| Bellwether Proposal submitted to Court  | N/A                                       | N/A  | 3/1/16  |
| Responses to Bellwether<br>Proposals  | N/A                                       | N/A  | 3/16/16   |
| Close of Case Specefic<br>Bellwether Discovery                                    | N/A                                       | 1/22/16  | 6/1/16  |
| Plaintiff's Initial Expert<br>Disclosures and reports                             | 7/15/15                                   | 2/22/16  | 5/15/16   |
| Defense Rebuttal expert reports   | 8/14/15                                   | 3/23/16  | 7/1/16  |
| Plaintiffs shall file motion<br>for leave to file Rebuttal<br>Expert Disclosures  | 9/14/15                                   | N/A  | N/A   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See Dkt. No. 1852 <sup>15</sup> See Dkt. No. 1900 <sup>16</sup> See Dkt. No. 1949-2

| Deadline for Expert<br>Depositions                                  | 10/13/15 | 5/23/16 | 11/1/16       |
|---|----------|---------|---------------|
| Dispositive Motions and<br>Daubert Motions                          | 12/12/15 | 6/22/16 | 12/15/16      |
| Oppositions to Dispositive<br>Motions and Daubert<br>Motions filed  | 1/11/16  | 7/7/16  | 1/2/17        |
| Replies in Support of Dispositive Motions and Daubert Motions filed | 2/10/16  | 7/22/16 | 1/15/17       |
| Hearing on Dispositive<br>Motions and Daubert<br>Motinos            | N/A      | 8/8/16  | February 2017 |
| Final Pre-trial Hearing   | N/A      | 9/7/16  | March 2017    |
| Case are Trial Ready  | N/A      | 10/3/16 | April 2017    |

Date: June 23, 2015 Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Kimberly A. Dougherty
Kimberly A. Dougherty
JANET, JENNER & SUGGS, LLC
31 St. James Avenue, Suite 365
Boston, MA 02116
Telephone: 617/933-1265
kdougherty@myadvocates.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee

Thomas M. Sobol Kristen Johnson Parker HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO, LLP 55 Cambridge Parkway, Suite 301

Cambridge, MA 02142 Telephone: 617/482-3700 Facsimile: 617/482-3003 tom@hbsslaw.com kristenjp@hbsslaw.com

Plaintiffs' Lead Counsel

Elizabeth J. Cabraser
Mark P. Chalos
Annika Martin
LIEFF CABRASER, HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP
275 Battery Street, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: 415/956-1000
Facsimile: 415/956-1008
ecabraser@lchb.com
mchalos@lchb.com

#### Federal/State Liaison

Marc E. Lipton LIPTON LAW 18930 W. 10 Mile Road Southfield, MI 48075 Telephone: 248/557-1688 Facsimile: 248/557-6344 marc@liptonlaw.com

Patrick T. Fennell CRANDALL & KATT 366 Elm Avenue, S.W. Roanoke, VA 24016 Telephone: 540/342-2000 Facsimile: 540/400-0616 pfennell@crandalllaw.com

Mark Zamora
ZAMORA FIRM
6 Concourse Parkway, 22<sup>nd</sup> Floor
Atlanta, GA 30328
Telephone: 404/451-7781
Facsimile: 404/506-9223
mark@markzamora.com

J. Gerard Stranch, IV
Benjamin A. Gastel
BRANSTETTER, STRANCH & JENNINGS, PLLC
227 Second Avenue North
Nashville, TN 37201
Telephone: (615) 254-8801

Facsimile: (615) 255-5419 gerards@branstetterlaw.com Plaintiffs' Steering Committee

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Kimberly A. Dougherty, hereby certify that I caused a copy of the above *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee's ("PSC") Amended Filing Related to the PSC, St. Thomas Entities, Tennessee Clinic Defendants, Premier Defendants and Box Hill Defendants' Proposed Pretrial Schedules to be filed electronically via the Court's electronic filing system. Those attorneys who are registered with the Court's electronic filing system may access these filings through the Court's system, and notice of these filings will be sent to these parties by operation of the Court's electronic filing system.* 

Dated: June 23, 2015

/s/ Kimberly A. Dougherty
Kimberly A. Dougherty, Esq.